
MEETING	ECONOMIC & CITY DEVELOPMENT OVERVIEW & SCRUTINY COMMITTEE
DATE	29 SEPTEMBER 2009
PRESENT	COUNCILLORS PIERCE (CHAIR), HUDSON (VICE-CHAIR), HYMAN, HOLVEY, KIRK, SCOTT, POTTER AND D'AGORNE

15. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Members were invited to declare at this point in the meeting any personal or prejudicial interests, other than the standing declarations, that they might have in the business on the agenda.

Councillor Pierce expressed a personal non prejudicial interest in Agenda Item 4, the Finance and Performance Monitor 1 Report, as a board member for York Travellers Trust.

Councillor Scott expressed a personal non prejudicial interest in Agenda Item 5, the Interim Report of the Water Lane Councillor Call for Action Task Group and General Update, as the Member who registered the original CCfA.

Councillor D'Agorne also expressed a personal non prejudicial interest in Agenda Item 5, as a member of the Cycle Touring Club.

Councillor Holvey expressed a personal non prejudicial interest in Agenda Item 8, the Economic Development Programme, in his role as an Economic Policy Manager for Leeds City Council.

Councillor Hyman also expressed a personal non prejudicial interest in Agenda Item 8, as the Council's representative on the York-England.com Board, and as a member of the Audit Board for Science City York.

Councillor Pierce expressed a personal non prejudicial interest in Agenda Item 8 as a former lecturer and current researcher at the University of York.

16. MINUTES

RESOLVED: That the minutes of the last meeting of the Committee held on 12 August 2009 be approved and signed by the Chair as a correct record.

17. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

It had been reported that there had been no registrations to speak under the Council's Public Participation Scheme.

18. FINANCE AND PERFORMANCE MONITOR 1 REPORT

Members received a report into the 2009/10 financial and performance forecast outturn position in City Strategy, Housing Services and Licensing and Regulation within Neighbourhood Services.

Members highlighted an issue regarding spending on bus tokens. The tokens were sold to City of York Council at face value but because only a small percentage of these were ever redeemed, National Transport Tokens were able to make a profit.

Officers answered a query from Members relating to the overspend on bus tokens within the budget. They stated that there had been an unexpected demand from eligible members of the public to register for the bus tokens rather than bus passes.

Some Members suggested that the City of York Council could issue their own transport tokens rather than purchasing them from National Transport Tokens. They thought that Ryedale District Council had issued their own tokens and they felt that the benefit of such a scheme to a Local Authority far outweighed the costs for distribution.

The Committee agreed that they would like to receive a more in-depth report on this and agreed to add this to their workplan. (Minute 23 refers.)

Further discussions also ensued on the following issues:

- Remedial action taking place through the reduction of funds for non specific departmental projects.
- The reasons for overspending of utility costs at Travellers Sites.
- Statistics on homelessness and how new allocation measures had made a significant impact on overall numbers.
- Unemployment numbers and trends in York in relation to the national average.

RESOLVED: That the report be noted.

REASON: To update the scrutiny committee of the latest finance and performance position.

19. INTERIM REPORT OF THE WATER LANE COUNCILLOR CALL FOR ACTION TASK GROUP AND GENERAL UPDATE

Members considered an Interim Report updating them on the first meeting of the Water Lane Councillor Call For Action(CCfA) task group, and on the relevant outcomes of the Executive Member for City Strategy Decision Session on 1st September 2009, Scrutiny Management Committee(Calling In) on 14th September 2009 and Executive (Calling In) on 15th September 2009.

Discussions between Members and Officers concerned the following issues:

- The cost of the Water Lane cycle scheme.
- Possible future planning applications by St Peter's School and whether this would block access and lead to the temporary removal of speed cushions in Westminster Road.
- The legal implications shown in the Draft Remit for the Committee in relation to the CCfA, coming from the Land Compensation Act 1973.

Members agreed that the outcome of the Executive(Calling In) meeting on 15th September 2009, had gone a long way towards easing some of the immediate concerns raised by the CCfA. However, there was still work to be undertaken by the Committee in terms of long term solutions and addressing the remaining issues set up in the Draft Remit(Annex D of the report refers.)

Members of the Committee decided to form a task group to look at items 2,3 and 4 of the remit. These items are:

- If any further improvements can be made to address the current traffic issues in the Water End area.
- To identify measures or actions that can be taken to assist in the smooth implementation of similar schemes in the city.
- To understand the context of the Land Compensation Act 1973 in relation to the CCfA.

This task group would be comprised of Councillors Scott, Pierce, Hudson and D'Agorne.

Objective one of the remit will be looked at after the 1 December 2009, when the Executive Member for City Strategy has received his report for the Decision Session. This will include the results of surveys conducted in the Water Lane area of the city. Members of the Committee will be asked for their views on this report prior to the Executive Member making his decision.

RESOLVED: (i) That the CCfA is still live but some of the initial concerns have been *resolved* ~~appeased~~ since it was first registered.

(ii) That the draft remit be approved.

REASON: In order to progress the CCfA.

[As amended at the Economic & City Development Overview & Scrutiny Committee meeting on 8 December 2009]

20. IMPLEMENTATION OF PLANNING CONDITIONS AND ADOPTION OF NEW ESTATES

Members considered a report to update them on the implementation of planning conditions and the adoption of new estates. This report included

the decision taken by the Executive Member for City Strategy at the Decision Session on 1st September 2009. This topic had originally been suggested as a Scrutiny topic for the committee by Councillor Simpson Laing at a previous meeting held on 14th July 2009. Her further comments are attached to these minutes

At the Executive Member Decision Session for City Strategy on the 1st September, the Executive Member requested an interim progress report in the final quarter of the year to show which highways adoptions have been completed, he also recommended that officers make contact with other Local Authorities for examples of best practice and asked for arrangements to be made to establish a local developer forum to meet twice a year with the Executive Member and Officers to discuss current and future schemes.

Members appreciated the reasons for why Councillor Simpson Laing had brought forward the issue to the committee, but suggested that the decision taken by the Executive Member on the 1st September 2009 was a step forward.

Members also added that the Executive Member report was very thorough and that it would be beneficial to look at the progress report due to be presented to the Executive Member for City Strategy in the final quarter of the year.

- RESOLVED:
- (i) That the report to the Executive Member for City Strategy dated 18th August 2009 be noted.
 - (ii) That the decision on whether to progress this topic to review be deferred until after the Executive Member for City Strategy has received his progress report.

REASON: To allow for a further progress report to be received.

21. NEWGATE MARKET - FOCUS REPORT

Members received a focus report on Newgate Market which updated information given to the committee verbally at the meeting held on the 15th July 2009. The information requested by the committee in the report was a general overview of trading conditions as a result of the current economic climate.

Officers updated Members on the current conditions in the market and said that although the national economic downturn had affected outdoor market traders, that during the year the number of licensed traders within Newgate and the number of casual pitches used has increased.

Discussions between Members and Officers related to:

- The City Centre Action Plan and associated funding.
- Properties on the Shambles and how they relate to Newgate Market.

- The effect of Continental Markets in Parliament Street on stalls within the market.

Certain Members expressed a desire for a more comparative stance within the Officer's report for example, on what makes a good market.

- RESOLVED:
- (i) That the report and the information provided by Officers be noted.
 - (ii) That a Feasibility Report on the immediate, short term and long term development of Newgate Market should be prepared by the Scrutiny Officer for the next meeting of the Committee.

REASON: To inform the work of the Committee.

22. ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME

Members considered a report from the Assistant Director of Economic Partnerships and Development, on the Economic Development Programme. This report, with an updated overview of the current economic climate, was requested by the Committee at the meeting on the 14th July 2009. In addition to the report Councillor D'Agorne also tabled a report on Green Tasks Jobs. This was to be presented to the Executive on 6th October 2009 and can be found on the Council's website. He also tabled a document entitled "A New Approach" and this is attached as an annex to these minutes.

Members and Officers discussed the following issues:

- The significance of Science City York in the development of a future technology and science cluster and its wider links with the city.
- The York Central development
- Methods of improving the reputation of jobs within certain career areas such as tourism.
- Economic resilience and alternative methods to approach economic development given the current national downturn.

Members suggested in relation to the discussion of Science City York that they would like to invite the Chief Executive Officer of Science City York to give a presentation and answer Members questions on its relationship with the economic development of the city.

They then added that the Leader of the Council, Councillor Waller, should be invited to attend this presentation.

The Officer recommended that Members might wish to attend the Pre Council Seminar on Science City York on 15th October 2009.

- RESOLVED:
- (i) That the report be noted.

- (ii) That, if required, after the pre Council Seminar Science City York be invited to address the Committee.

REASON: To inform the work of the Committee.

23. WORKPLAN AND FORWARD PLAN EXTRACTS

Members considered the work plan for the Economic and City Development Overview & Scrutiny Committee for 2009-10.

The Scrutiny Officer updated Members that the Scrutiny Management Committee had recently allocated a new Councillor Call for Action (CCfA) in relation to parking, safety and maintenance issues at Broadway shops to the committee. The Committee asked the Scrutiny Officer to prepare a feasibility report on this for the December meeting.

Members agreed that the following work areas be added to the work plan:

- To receive a further in depth report on bus tokens. (Minute 18 refers.)
- To receive and comment on an interim report from the CCfA (Water Lane) Task Group. (Minute 19 refers.)
- To receive a report on adoption of estates due to be presented to the Executive Member for City Strategy before deciding whether to progress the topic to a scrutiny review. (Minute 20 refers.)
- To receive a feasibility report on Newgate Market. (Minute 21 refers.)
- To invite Science City York, if required, to address the committee at a later date. (Minute 22 refers.)
- To receive feasibility report on the Broadway Shops CCfA in December. (Minute 23 refers.)

RESOLVED: That the reports detailed above be added to the work plan of this Committee.

REASON: To assist in the planning of work for this Committee.

Councillor R Pierce, Chair

[The meeting started at 5.35 pm and finished at 8.00 pm].

Comments from Councillor Simpson-Laing
Agenda Item 6 – Implementation of Planning Conditions & Adoption of
New Estates
Tuesday 29th September 2009

In my view there still seems to be confusion within CYC at what is being requested and this is borne out in Annex A - Para 9 which has nothing to do with the issue of the Scrutiny Topic submitted.

Across the City there have in recent years been developments, as mentioned in Annex A - Para 14, and also including St Peter's Quarter, and until recently Sovereign Park, that have been left without 'services' that residents expected to receive.

The problem is that Planning Conditions are not being monitored. This is clear as I noted at Planning on Thursday 24th September that the 'Outline Conditions' clearly state that certain conditions have to be met before work can commence and yet now we are at the 'Reserved Matters' stage and still the conditions have not been met. Is the issue that CYC set conditions for them to be ignored and so Councillors are wasting their time trying to win a losing battle or is it that there is a staffing issue in both Development Control and Legal. Either way the word must be getting around that its ok to 'go off plan' as CYC will not bother to stop the work. Just how many 'Stop Notices' have CYC issued to big national developers

I also feel that the adoption of communal or community areas should also be included in this Scrutiny. Again due to the lack of on site visits to monitor work these areas are often not adopted for sometime due to incorrect planning and/or sub standard planting. Whilst the arguments go on between CYC and the developers the residents are left living in a 'jungle' with communal areas left to go 'wild'. Then the merry go round starts of the residents complaining to the Councillors, the Councillors reporting it to the Council and the Council saying that they cannot do anything about the 'mess' as it is private land and so it goes around and around.

The outcome is that residents are not happy and yet there seem to be, and this is in residents' words, *'putting the ball in someone else's court because as long as CYC get their Council Tax they don't care'*.

It clearly seems that this issue is neither understood or wanted to be understood by the Executive Member. What he fails to realise is that in the end such schemes take up hundreds of Council Officers time and cost the Council money where as proper monitoring in the first place and the appropriate use of the law would save time and money

This page is intentionally left blank

**Submission from Councillor D'Agorne -A Different Approach
Agenda Item 8-Economic Development Programme Tuesday 29th
September 2009**

Under item 8 on the agenda for the Economic and City Development Overview and Scrutiny Committee Sept 29th 2009 I would like to propose that our workplan must include a more critical analysis of the strategy for developing a more sustainable local economy, drawing on the work of organisations like the New Economics Foundation.

Members who want to learn more about this perspective can look at their websites: www.neweconomics.org and www.pluggingtheleaks.org This is the basic critique of the conventional approach in our current strategy that focusses on promoting competition and expanding exports:

A Different Approach

The issue is not necessarily that too little money flows into a neighbourhood. Rather, it is what consumers, public services and businesses do with that money. Too often it is spent on services with no local presence, and so immediately leaves the area (hence the concept of a 'leaky bucket').

Our starting point is the energy for changing the local economy from within a community, and the natural resourcefulness, skills and passions of local people. The principle behind this approach is that people who live and work in a place, and others who care about its future, are best positioned to find enterprising solutions, implement them and reap the rewards.

In many places different parts of the economy - local businesses, voluntary sector agencies, and the public sector - do not talk to each other to maximise local opportunities. For the local economy to undergo durable and robust change, the capability and energy of everybody needs to be harnessed. We believe that promoting and supporting local enterprise should be part of any strategy for economic regeneration. Local enterprises are more likely to employ local people, provide services to improve the local quality of life, spend money locally and so circulate wealth in the community, promote community cohesion and, by reducing transportation of goods from across communities, are likely to have a smaller environmental footprint. The approach also recognises that communities do not develop their local economies in isolation.

Contrast this with Section A2 of the Economic Development Strategy and Action Programme

"York has a lower proportion of foreign owned companies than most comparator regions. As a result the city is losing out on access to potentially better products and process technologies and access to knowledge from parent companies.... Increasing the number of foreign owned firms would

likely improve competition in the market in York." AND yet York is acknowledged to have a strong local economy and jobs market (page62)

Proposal:

In the light of this, the committee might consider looking at the work that the New Economics Foundation has done in regeneration and community enterprise, particularly in relation to the findings of Yorks Green Task Force on developing a low carbon economy that can capitalise on the opportunities for developing green technologies (please insert paper from Exec agenda for Oct 6th)

For example:

The **Green New Deal** is a response to the credit crunch and wider energy and food crises, and to the lack of comprehensive, joined-up action from politicians. It calls for:

- Massive investment in renewable energy and wider environmental transformation in the UK, leading to,
- The creation of thousands of new green collar jobs
- Reining in reckless aspects of the finance sector – but making low-cost capital available to fund the UK's green economic shift
- Building a new alliance between environmentalists, industry, agriculture, and unions to put the interests of the real economy ahead of those of footloose finance

The Green New Deal is published by **nef** on behalf of the Green New Deal Group

Local Multiplier 3 (LM3)

Measuring your impact on the local economy

LM3 allows any organisation to measure its economic impact on the local economy and work out how to improve it.

Across the UK, organisations face the same growing challenge: how to deliver more for less. The public sector faces budget cuts for the next decade, while the not-for-profit sector faces a dwindling pot and movement away from grant-making.

LM3 makes it possible for them to understand where their money goes, how that money impacts on the local economy, and, most importantly, how to improve the local economy while spending the same or less money. It marks a step-change in measuring economic sustainability by enabling any organisation to measure any expenditure on any geographic area using current data.

http://www.pluggingtheleaks.org/downloads/local_alchemy_overview.pdf